

## CITY AND COUNTY OF SWANSEA

### MINUTES OF THE AREA 1 DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE

HELD AT THE COUNCIL CHAMBER, CIVIC CENTRE, SWANSEA. ON  
TUESDAY, 24 JUNE 2014 AT 2.00 PM

**PRESENT:** R Francis-Davies (Chair) presided

<b>Councillor(s)</b>	<b>Councillor(s)</b>	<b>Councillor(s)</b>
J C Bayliss	F M Gordon	P Lloyd
U C Clay	J A Hale	K E Marsh
S E Crouch	J E C Harris	P M Matthews
N J Davies	C A Holley	B G Owen
P Downing	E T Kirchner	L G Thomas
C R Doyle	A S Lewis	L V Walton
V A Evans	R D Lewis	T M White

10 **TO RECEIVE APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE.**

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors B Hopkins, JW Jones, CE Lloyd, HM Morris, J Newbury, PB Smith, DG Sullivan, C Thomas and GD Walker

11 **TO RECEIVE DISCLOSURES OF PERSONAL AND PREJUDICIAL INTERESTS.**

In accordance with the Code of Conduct adopted by the City and County of Swansea, the following interests were declared:-

Councillors JC Bayliss, SE Crouch, CR Doyle, P Downing, NJ Davies, CA Holley, ET Kirchner, RD Lewis, KE Marsh, P Matthews, BG Owen, D Phillips, LV Walton and TM White – Personal - Minute No.14 (Item 2 – Application No.2014/0076) – One of the objectors is known to me.

Councillors SE Crouch and D Phillips – Personal – Minute No.14 (Item 2 – Application No.2014/0076) – Condition 12 refers to the street in which I am a resident.

12 **MINUTES.**

**RESOLVED** that the Minutes of the meeting of the Area 1 Development Control Committee held on 27 May 2014 be approved as a correct record subject to the name of councillor JA Hale being added to the list of apologies..

13 **ITEMS FOR DEFERRAL / WITHDRAWAL.**

None.

14 **DETERMINATION OF PLANNING APPLICATIONS UNDER THE TOWN AND COUNTRY PLANNING ACT 1990.**

The Head of Economic Regeneration and Planning submitted a series planning applications. Amendments to this schedule were reported and are indicated below by (#).

**RESOLVED** that: -

1) The undermentioned planning applications **BE REFUSED** for the reasons indicated below:

**# (Item 1) Planning Application No.2012/1226**

Construction of a four / three storey block containing 50 residential apartments (Class C3) and 1 no. ground floor retail unit (Class A1) with associated undercroft car parking (outline - including details of access, appearance, layout and scale) at The Boat Yard, adjacent to Fishmarket Quay, Trawler Road, Maritime Quarter, Swansea.

Mr J Woolliscroft, Mr F Bowen & Mr P East (objectors) and Mr S Williams (agent) addressed the Committee.

7 late letters of objection reported.

Late Letters from the Marina Manager (City and County of Swansea) and Celtic Instrumentation Ltd (Leaseholder) reported.

Application refused contrary to officer recommendation for the following reasons:-

1. The introduction of a residential use in close proximity to existing business uses would be detrimental to the residential amenity that future residents of the proposed development could reasonably expect to enjoy by virtue of the noise, smells and air pollution generated by the existing business operations. The proposal is therefore contrary to Policies EV2, EV40, HC2 and CC1 of the City and County of Swansea Unitary Development Plan (2008).
2. The introduction of a residential use within close proximity to existing business activities, namely the marina boatyard(including the boat hoist operation) and commercial fish market would likely result in nuisance complaints from future occupiers of the proposed residential apartments, which in turn could unduly impact on the operations of those existing businesses, which are of strategic importance to the City and County of Swansea and its adopted vision to make Swansea a vibrant, attractive and distinctive 21st century Waterfront City which capitalises on its waterfront location. The proposal is therefore contrary to policies EV2, EV40, HC2 and CC1 of the City and County of Swansea Unitary Development Plan (2008).
3. The proposed development fails to provide any off-street car parking for visitors to the development which will lead to an increase in parking on the adjoining highway network to the detriment of highway safety. The proposal is therefore contrary to policies EV1, EV3, AS6 and CC1 of the City and County of Swansea Unitary Development Plan (2008).

**# (Item 2) Planning Application No.2014/0076**

Side roof extension, first floor side extension, and external alterations to facilitate change of use from offices (Class B1) to 4 no. 2 bedroom and 5 no. 1 bedroom self contained apartments (Class C3) with associated parking at 34 Hanover Street, Swansea.

Mr D Roberts, Mr J Moore, Mrs L Hulme & Mr J Green (objectors) and Mr P Baxter (agent) addressed the Committee

Report updated as follows:-

Further observations received from two residents raising the following issues separation distances between the proposed development and existing houses below the Council's guidelines thereby affecting privacy. The images submitted are drawn from the Design Guide for Householder Development.

Comments from an architect both prior to and after the submission of further plans. The comments submitted prior to the submission of amended plans refer to perceived inaccuracies in the plans, distances between the site and adjacent properties, refers to guidelines set out in the Residential Design Guide and Infill and Backland Design Guide and recommends a review of scheme in the light of this guidance. Following the submission of the additional drawings, the architect has indicated he considers the plans are clearer than the original drawings and accord much closer to the impression from a site visit. He considers the other issues previously raised should be pursued.

With regard to these comments, members are advised that the scheme is a change of use and extensions to an existing building. The guidelines referred to above do not therefore apply to this scheme. Notwithstanding this, the general issue of residential amenity is material to the determination of the application .

Following the submission of additional plans, the list of plans at the end of the report should now read:

3337/PA/001 site plan, 3337/PA/003 existing ground and first floor plans, 3337/PA/004 existing second floor and garage plans, 3337/PA/005 existing elevations, 3337/PA/012 proposed elevations, received 28<sup>th</sup> January 2014 and 3337/PA/002 REV A Amended Plan – existing site survey, 3337/PA/010 REV A Amended Plan – proposed site survey, 3337/PA/011 REV A Amended Plan – Proposed Ground, First and Second Floor Plans, 3337/PA/013 REV A Amended Plan – Proposed Section B-B Section D-D, 3337/PA/014 Amended Plan – Proposed Section through neighbouring properties, dated 13<sup>th</sup> June 2014

Application refused contrary to officer recommendation for the following reasons:-

1. The proposed development constitutes a cramped and over-intensive form of development that will be detrimental to the residential amenity that residents of nearby properties could reasonably expect to enjoy by virtue of increased noise and disturbance through comings and goings, particularly from the rear access, and by virtue of overlooking of properties to the rear of the site. The development is

therefore contrary to policies EV1, EV2 and HC6 of the City and County of Swansea Unitary Development Plan (2008)

2. The proposed development will result in an unacceptable impact on local car parking and highway safety by virtue of the demand for car parking and vehicle movements associated with the density of development. The proposal is therefore contrary to policies EV1, HC6 and AS6 of the City and County of Swansea Unitary Development Plan (2008)

The meeting ended at 3.57 pm

**CHAIR**